



**David M. Hart,
“Was Molinari a true
Anarcho-Capitalist?: An
Intellectual History of the
Private and Competitive
Production of Security”**

A Paper given at the Libertarian Scholars
Conference, NYC, 28 Sept. 2019

dmhart@mac.com
dhart@libertyfund.org
<davidmhart.com/liberty>

1. An Intellectual Pre-History of the “Production of Security”: Destutt de Tracy, J.B. Say, Adolphe Thiers, Emile de Girardin

1. A Note on the term “Anarcho-Capitalism”
2. The Prehistory of an Idea: The State as an Unproductive Parasite or Ulcer in the Body Politick: Destutt de Tracy (1754-1836) and Jean-Baptiste Say (1767-1832)
3. The Metaphor of Society as an “Insurance Company”: Molinari and Adolphe Thiers
4. When the Metaphor becomes Reality: Emile de Girardin (1806-1881) and Molinari

2. Some Key Terms and Rhetorical Tropes in Molinari's Theory

1. Key Terms
 1. “la production de la sécurité” (the production of security) with its related terms producers and consumers of security
 2. “les compagnies d’assurances” (private insurance companies) or “les compagnies d’assurances sur la propriété” (property insurance companies) charging “les primes” (premiums) for protection
 3. “la liberté de gouvernement” (the liberty of government, or free government, the political analog to “la liberté des échanges” (free trade)) , i.e. the competitive provision of security in the free market
2. Rhetorical Tropes
 1. Adam Smith and “the fees of court” quote from *Wealth of Nations* competing courts and judges
 2. Adam Smith on the difficult task which lay ahead (from 1776) to defeat mercantilism and protection
 3. the “simple hypothesis” of the monopolist grocer (sometimes a baker)

3. Molinari on the “Production of Security”: A Baker's Dozen of Texts (1846-1904)

1. The period of “hard” ACT (1846-1887)
 1. "Electoral reform" (1846): taxpayers as shareholders in an insurance company
 2. “The Production of Security” (*JDE*, Feb. 1849): producers and consumers of security
 3. Soirée 11 (Sept. 1849): private property insurance companies
 4. The Debate about the Production of Security in the SEP (Oct. 1849): "swept away by delusions of logic"
 5. Articles in the *Dictionnaire de l'économie politique* (1852-53): the need for the fragmentation of nation states
 6. The *Cours d'économie politique* (1855, 1863), “Les consommations publiques” (Public Consumption) and the economic analysis of government (anti-economic)
 7. *Questions d'économie politique et de droit public* (1861): liberty in the production of security will be “The Crowning Achievement of political and economic progress”
 8. *L'Évolution politique* (1884), "Les gouvernements de l'avenir” (Governments of the Future): the privatisation of government functions
 9. *Les Lois naturelles* (1887) “La Liberté de gouvernement” (The Freedom of Government): private "property development companies" and private cities and towns; the "double right of secession"
2. The Period of “soft” ACT and “backtracking” towards an ultra-minimalist limited state classical liberal like Bastiat
 10. *Notions fondamentales* (1891) “La Simplification De L'état” (Reducing the Size of the State): still a believer after 40 years
 11. *Précis d'économie politique et de morale* (1893) “Les Doits et la Lois positive” (Rights and the Positive Law): positive law and conventional rights
 12. *Comment se résoudra la question sociale* (1896) “La révolution silencieuse” (The Silent Revolution): government's monopoly of security has become "monstrous"
 13. *La Société future* (1899) “La constitution libre des gouvernements” (The Free Constitution of Governments): one step forward and two steps backward
 14. *Les Problèmes du XXe siècle* (1901) “Le problème du gouvernement collectif” (The Problem of Collective Government): security is now produced for the benefit of the rulers
3. A rekindling of hope for the future?
 15. *Where is the Classical Liberal Utopia?* (1904): A Final “Fanciful” Hypothesis of total global competition in all things

3. Conclusion: Was Molinari a True ‘Anarcho-Capitalist’?

1. "hard" ACT (1849-1887)
 1. the (private) production of security, such as police and national defence
 2. the (private) production of law, *de facto* justice, conventional law, fees of court
2. “soft” ACT (1889-1901)
 3. competing governments both within and without the nation state
 4. the voluntary vs. the compulsory payment for services rendered
3. or was he concealing his real unchanged radical thoughts?

4. Appendices: Texts and Translations

1. Appendix 1: Adam Smith and the "Fees of Court"
2. Appendix 2: "Our Hypothesis" about the Monopolist Grocer (*Cours* version 1855, 1863)
3. Appendix 3: The "Simple Hypothesis" of the Monopolist Baker (*L'évolution politique* (1884) version)
4. Appendix 4: "La Lois électorale" (1846)
5. Appendix 5: "The Production of Security" (1849)
6. Appendix 6: "The 11th Soirée: On Government and its Function" (1849)
7. Appendix 7: The Debate about Molinari and the Functions of Government in the PES (Oct. 1849 Feb. 1850)
8. Appendix 8: "Nations" and "Towns" *DEP* (1852-53)

5. Some Further Reading

Online

The OLL website:

- the Gustave de Molinari (1819-1912) Project page at the Online Library of Liberty <<https://oll.libertyfund.org/pages/molinari-project-summary>>
- the *Liberty Matters* online discussion of "Gustave de Molinari's Legacy for Liberty" conducted in May 2013 <<https://oll.libertyfund.org/pages/roderick-long-gustave-de-molinari-s-legacy-for-liberty-may-2013>>
- Author page: <<https://oll.libertyfund.org/people/gustave-de-molinari>>
- Liberty Fund's translation (2019 draft): *Les Soirées de la Rue Saint-Lazare: Entretiens sur les lois économiques et défense de la propriété* (Evenings on Saint Lazarus Street: Discussions on Economic Laws and the Defence of Property) (1849) <<https://oll.libertyfund.org/pages/gdm-soirees3>>
 - the Editor's Introduction (short version 2019) <<https://oll.libertyfund.org/pages/gdm-soirees3#toc7>>
 - the Editor's Introduction (long version 2016) <<https://oll.libertyfund.org/pages/gdm-soirees#reflections>>
 - Further Aspects of Molinari's Life and Thought <<https://oll.libertyfund.org/pages/gdm-soirees3#toc60>>
 - Bibliography <<https://oll.libertyfund.org/pages/gdm-soirees3#toc276>>
 - Addendum with translations of "The Right to Vote" (23 July, 1846); "The Production of Security" (*JDE*, Feb. 1849); Minutes of the meetings of La Société d'économie politique discussing the Role of the State (Oct. 1849 Feb. 1849); Articles from *DEP* (1852) (Cities and Towns, Civilization, Fashion, Fine Arts, Freedom Of Commerce and Free Trade, Nations, Nobility) <<https://oll.libertyfund.org/pages/gdm-soirees3#toc44>>

Molinari's works at the Institut Coppet:

- eBooks: <<http://editions.institutcoppet.org/mot-cle-produit/gustave-de-molinari/>>
- Bibliography compiled by Benoît Malbranque (297 items) <<https://www.institutcoppet.org/bibliographie-gustave-de-molinari/>>.

- The Institut Coppet has announced a 30 volume collection of works of Molinari (March 2019): *Œuvres de Molinari et Documents le Concernant*. Une collection historique d'une trentaine de volumes, sous la direction de Mathieu Laine, avec le soutien d'André de Molinari, et avec un large appareil de notices et de notes par Benoît Malbranque. <<https://www.institutcoppet.org/annonce-a-loccasion-du-bicentenaire-de-la-naissance-de-g-de-molinari/>>
- Gustave de Molinari, *Les soirées de la rue Saint-Lazare (1849)*, Institut Coppet, 2014, 280pp <<https://www.institutcoppet.org/molinari-les-soirees-de-la-rue-saint-lazare-1849/>>

David Hart's website:

- summary list of material <<http://davidmhart.com/liberty/#molinari>>
- some papers by DMH:
 - "Gustave de Molinari and the Anti-Statist Liberal Tradition" (1979, 1981-82). This first appeared as an Honours thesis presented as part of an Honours degree in the Department of History at Macquarie University, Sydney in 1979. It was subsequently published in three parts in the *Journal of Libertarian Studies*, Vol. 5, nos. 3 and 4 and Vol. 6, no. 1 (1981-82). <<http://davidmhart.com/liberty/FrenchClassicalLiberals/Molinari/Thesis/index.html>>
 - "Gustave de Molinari and The Seven Musketeers of French Political Economy in the 1840s" (2015) <<http://davidmhart.com/liberty/Papers/Molinari/SevenMusketeers/SevenMusketeers.html>>
 - "The Struggle against Protectionism, Socialism, and the Bureaucratic State: The Economic Thought of Gustave de Molinari, 1845-1855" (2016) <<http://davidmhart.com/liberty/Papers/Molinari/EconomicThought/index.html>>
 - Longer version of CUP chapter: "The Paris School of Liberal Political Economy, 1803-1853" (2018) <<http://davidmhart.com/liberty/Papers/ParisSchool/index.html>>
 - "Gustave de Molinari (1819–1912): A Survey of the Life and Work of an “Économiste Dure” (A Hard-Core Economist)" (2018) <<http://davidmhart.com/liberty/FrenchClassicalLiberals/Molinari/BiographicalIntro2018.html>>
- A Hypertext Annotated Edition of Molinari's *Les Soirées de la rue Saint-Lazare* (1849). With Notes, Texts, and Glossaries (2017) <<http://davidmhart.com/liberty/AnnotatedMolinari/index.html>>
- my anthologies of his writings (en français)
 - *Jacques Bonhomme: L'éphémère journal de Frédéric Bastiat et Gustave de Molinari (11 juin – 13 juillet 1848)*. *Recueil de tous les articles, augmenté d'une introduction*. Ed. Benoît Malbranque (Paris: Institut Coppet, 2014). This is a collection of the street magazine Molinari, Bastiat, and some other friends published during June 1848 and handed out on the streets of Paris. Originals online <<http://davidmhart.com/liberty/FrenchClassicalLiberals/Molinari/JB/index.html>>.
 - *The Bicentennial Anthology of Gustave de Molinari's Writings on the State (1846-1911)* (2019): this contains a detailed biographical essay on his life and work, 24 extracts from his writings between 1846-1911 with brief introductions to each one, and an updated bibliography of his works
 - DMH, "Gustave de Molinari (1819–1912): A Survey of the Life and Work of an “Économiste Dure” (A Hard-Core Economist)" (2018) <<http://davidmhart.com/liberty/FrenchClassicalLiberals/Molinari/BiographicalIntro2018.html>>
 - Introductions to the Texts <<http://davidmhart.com/liberty/FrenchClassicalLiberals/Molinari/Anthology/2019/Introductions.html>>

- Updated Bibliography (Dec. 2018) <<http://davidmhart.com/liberty/FrenchClassicalLiberals/Molinari/Bibliography-2018.html>>. Books, Printed Pamphlets, and Intros to books (73 titles): This list is a complete list of all stand alone books (44), books for which he wrote a preface or an introduction (9), and pamphlets or reprints of articles he had written (18); Articles (240).
- *The Collected Articles by Gustave de Molinari from the Dictionnaire de l'économie politique (1852-53)* (2019). Molinari wrote 24 principle articles [8 in vol. 1; 16 in vol. 2]; and 5 biographical articles [1 in vol. 1; 4 in vol. 2] <<http://davidmhart.com/liberty/FrenchClassicalLiberals/Molinari/DEP/index.html>>
- *The Founding Father of Anarcho-Capitalism: Molinari's Collected Writings on the Private and Competitive Production of Security (1846-1904)* (2019). A collection of 15 of his key writings on this topic.
 - Texts: not yet online
 - Editor's Introduction is this conference paper “Was Molinari a true Anarcho-Capitalist?: An Intellectual History of the Private and Competitive Production of Security” (Sept. 2019).
- other things:
 - Bibliography of his Works (Dec. 2018) <<http://davidmhart.com/liberty/FrenchClassicalLiberals/Molinari/Bibliography-2018.html>>
 - My translation of the "11th Soirée" in *Panarchy: Political Theories of Non-Territorial States*, ed. Aviezer Tucker, Gian Piero de Bellis (Routledge, 2016).

Printed Publications

David M. Hart, "Molinari, Gustave de (1819-1912)," *The Encyclopedia of Libertarianism*, eds. Ronald Hamowy et al. (Los Angeles: Sage, 2008), pp. 336-37. Online: <<https://www.libertarianism.org/encyclopedia/molinari-gustave-de>>.

David M. Hart, “The Paris School of Liberal Political Economy, 1803-1853” in *The Cambridge History of French Thought*, ed. Michael Moriarty and Jeremy Jennings (Cambridge University Press, 2019), pp. 301-12.

Leroux, Robert and David M. Hart eds. *French Liberalism in the 19th Century: An anthology*. (London: Routledge, 2012).

Leroux, Robert and David M. Hart eds. *L'Âge d'or du libéralisme français: Anthologie XIXe siècle*. (Paris: Ellipses, 2014).

Minart, Gérard. *Gustave de Molinari (1819-1912), Pour un gouvernement à bon marché dans un milieu libre* (Paris: Éditions de l'Institut Coquelin, Charles. 2012).

Gustave de Molinari, *The Production of Security*, trans. J. Huston McCulloch and a Preface by Murray N. Rothbard. Occasional Papers Series #2 (Richard M. Ebeling, Editor), New York: The Center for Libertarian Studies, May 1977.

Molinari, My translation of the "11th Soirée" in *Panarchy: Political Theories of Non-Territorial States*, ed. Aviezer Tucker, Gian Piero de Bellis (Routledge, 2016).